4602 Committee
Michael Winikoff (chair), Eneko Aguirre, Noa Agmon, Christian Blum, Longbing Cao, Sergio Grecco, Reza Haffari

Conflicts of Interest

Eneko Agirre has a moderate conflict (publishing 3+ full papers there in the last 5 years). He participated in discussion but not the final decision-making (i.e. managed by moderation)

Reza Haffari has a strong COI (one of the submitters) - managed by exclusion from all processes on this submission

Decision
Conference to be ranked as A

Justification

NAACL was ranked A and applied to be re-ranked as A*.

The various indicators for NAACL are all strong: the PC is strong and actively publishing at NAACL, it has a strong h5 (third in the area, behind ACL and EMNLP), and strong citations (although notable weaker than EMNLP and ACL).

Unfortunately the area leader analysis was non-repeatable due to manual selection of researchers. The report was re-run (using the Google Scholar label "natural language processing") and the results show EMNLP as #1, followed by ACL and then NAACL.

1. Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing (EMNLP)
This venue was published at 108 times by 10 of 13 individuals in the last 5+ years.

2. Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics (ACL)
This venue was published at 84 times by 10 of 13 individuals in the last 5+ years.

3. North American Chapter of the Association for Computational Linguistics (NAACL)
This venue was published at 36 times by 10 of 13 individuals in the last 5+ years.

So the quality of NAACL is clearly at A/A* level. In considering whether it should be A or A*, the key consideration was that NAACL was, on a range of indicators, not as strong as EMNLP.