

4606 Committee David Eyers (Chair), William Fornaciari, Abusayeed Saifullah, Jan Rellermeyer, Xiao Liu, Rachid Guerraoui.

Additional Reviewers Lin Padgham chaired the discussion as the committee chair was excluded due to conflict of

interest.

Conflicts of Interest

David Eyers had a strong CoI due to being on the Steering Committee and many years on the Program Committee. He was excluded from all reviewing and discussion. Jan Rellermeyer had a strong CoI due to being on the Steering Committee. He was excluded from all reviewing and discussion.

Decision Middleware to retain rank A for now, but be re-evaluated next round

Justification

The conference requested rank A* but was also on the review list to retain rank A. Citations and author strength are within the range of an A conference - closer to A than to B, but are slightly lower than average.

The PC was considered quite junior with a median h-index of 11 and only about 50% of members above the threshold for established researchers. The established researchers were also not publishing strongly in the conference. An additional area of concern was that paper numbers appear to be declining.

Unfortunately the area leaders data was not useful as the selection of people was not reproducible and there was subjective selection involved.

The submission did indicate the involvement of some strong people, including some IEEE Fellows, although it seems that the strongest of these do not often actually attend, suggesting that they perhaps see it as a good venue, rather than a top venue. There was no compelling evidence for A*. It is rather small to be a flagship.

There were a number of areas that suggested B rather than A, but the committee felt that the relatively good citations and author strength warranted it remaining at A for now. It should be re-assessed next round.

Time